A multi-gas perspective on urban climate mitigation

• Cities contribute **70% of greenhouse gas (GHG)** emissions that are responsible for the majority of observed and anticipated global warming – Strong mitigation action is needed.

• Most of this warming is attributed to emission of **carbon dioxide or CO₂** associated with combustion of fossil fuels. As a result, most efforts have been directed at reducing this key and important gas.

• However, the **non-CO₂ GHGs** emitted directly by human activities include methane (CH₄) and nitrous oxide (N₂O), and a group of industrial gases including perfluorocarbons (PFCs), hydrofluorocarbons (HFCs), and sulfur hexafluoride (SF₆). When taken together with the already banned chlorofluorocarbons (CFCs), their climate significance over the past century is **roughly equivalent to that of CO₂**.

• The objective of this note is to discuss the varying sources and impacts of CO₂ and non-CO₂ gases, place their emissions into context, and discuss ways in which cities can address their contributions to global warming.
Global warming via the greenhouse effect

- Light from the sun heats the surface of the Earth.

- There is a natural balance of light that reflects to space or heats the atmosphere.

- Some heat from the surface of the earth is “captured” by the natural CO\(_2\) and other gases in the atmosphere (water vapor, natural methane, etc.).

- The more we add CO\(_2\), methane and other GHGs to the atmosphere, the more heat energy the atmosphere absorbs from the surface of the earth.

- Over time, the balance shifts to a warmer equilibrium.

Source: US EPA (2012)
The problem is cumulative!

Warming won’t stop until we cease all carbon emissions.

Source: IPCC WG1, 2021
What is $\text{CO}_2$-equivalence?

- Increased $\text{CO}_2$ emissions are the primary driver of human-made climate change and global warming; however other emissions also contribute.

- The 6 primary gases that contribute (often called the ‘Kyoto gases’ because they were called out in the Kyoto Protocol) include: Carbon Dioxide ($\text{CO}_2$), Methane ($\text{CH}_4$), Nitrous Oxide ($\text{N}_2\text{O}$), Hydrofluorocarbons (HFCs), Perfluorocarbons (PFCs) and Sulfur Hexafluoride ($\text{SF}_6$).

- Each gas has a factor that allows you to convert 1 ton of emissions of other gases into the equivalent contribution of 1 ton of $\text{CO}_2$.

- When expressed as a ton of $\text{CO}_2$, the contribution of other gases are said to be expressed as “$\text{CO}_2$-equivalent” or “$\text{CO}_2\text{e}$.”

- The factor for converting other gases to $\text{CO}_2\text{e}$ is called the “global warming potential” or GWP and is usually expressed as the GWP$_{100}$ denoting that the accounting is done over a 100-year period.

- This accounting can be done for other time periods, such as 20 years, which is relevant for shorter-lived species, like methane.
Short-Lived Climate Pollutants (SLCPs)

• Some emissions are far more potent than CO₂ but may only last in the atmosphere for a few weeks or months. For these short-lived pollutants, a different GWP (like GWP₂₀) may provide better insight into their contribution to global warming over the near-term but can overestimate impact into the future.

• For example, kg for kg, methane warms much more than CO₂. However, methane has a lifetime of only 12 years, compared to CO₂’s lifetime of more than 100 years. Thus, 1 ton of methane is 28 times more potent than CO₂ measured over 100 years (GWP₁₀₀ = 28) because most of the methane will be gone after 10 or so years, but it is 86 times more potent than CO₂ when measured over a shorter period like 20 years (GWP₂₀ = 86).
Slacks of Black Carbon (BC), or soot, is a solid component of air pollution (fine particles) that results from inefficient combustion and lasts for only a few weeks in the air; however, 1 ton of BC emissions still warms the atmosphere hundreds of times more than 1 ton of CO₂ even when measured over 100 years and thousands of times more than CO₂ when measured over 20 years.

BC is also a component of fine particulate matter (PM₂.₅), the form of air pollution responsible for the greatest burden of air pollution-related disease, so reducing PM₂.₅ (especially from BC-rich sources) saves lives and cools the planet simultaneously and quickly!

Each pollutant has a unique potential to warm the planet and will also warm over a unique timescale.

While we need to reduce all climate pollution, reducing SLCPs immediately and avoiding lock-in to long-lived GHG infrastructure can provide immediate relief while we decarbonize the broader economy!
Ambient Air Pollution (AAP)

- Many sources of GHG emissions or SLCP emissions are also sources of more traditional air pollutants (i.e., fine particulate matter or PM$_{2.5}$, BC and organic carbon or OC, nitrogen dioxide or NO$_2$, sulfur dioxide or SO$_2$ and toxic chemicals).

- Reductions of GHGs that have common sources with ambient air pollution can result in multiple development benefits including cooling the planet, protecting public health associated with reduced air pollution exposure, increased food and energy security, reduced traffic fatalities and congestion, enhanced economic activity through alternative patterns of investment and quality-of-life benefits.

- By including the multiple benefits of emission reduction in GHG planning assessments, you can improve cost-benefit assessments and engage a broader array of stakeholders to support climate action plans with multiple benefits.
Example conversion factors (GWPs) to estimate GHGs as CO$_2$e

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Species</th>
<th>CO$_2$</th>
<th>CH$_4$</th>
<th>N$_2$O</th>
<th>HFCs (e.g., HFC$<em>{23}$, HFC$</em>{134a}$)</th>
<th>PFCs (e.g., NF$<em>3$, PFC$</em>{14}$)</th>
<th>SF$_6$</th>
<th>Black carbon</th>
<th>Organic carbon</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lifetime (Years)</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>228/ 14</td>
<td>569/ 50,000</td>
<td>3,200</td>
<td>Days-weeks</td>
<td>Days-weeks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GWP$_{100}$</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>273</td>
<td>14,600/1,530</td>
<td>17,400/7,380</td>
<td>25,200</td>
<td>460</td>
<td>-69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GWP$_{20}$</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>273</td>
<td>12,400/4,140</td>
<td>13,400/5,300</td>
<td>18,300</td>
<td>1600</td>
<td>-240</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It's true! Emitting one ton of SF$_6$ (sulfur hexafluoride, used in electrical switching equipment) will warm the planet over the next century as much as 25,000 tons of CO$_2$!

However, we emit far, far more CO$_2$ than SF$_6$, so it remains less of a problem.

Source: IPCC AR6, Chapter 7 supplementary material, Table 7.SM.7 BC and OC estimates are the Fuglestvedt et al. (2010) values from IPCC AR5, Ch. 8, negative value indicates cooling.
In the chart we see the breakdown of global emissions in 2016, measured on the basis of carbon dioxide-equivalents (CO₂e).

Carbon dioxide was the largest contributor, accounting for around three-quarters (74.4%) of total emissions. Methane contributed 17.3%; nitrous oxide, 6.2%; and other emissions (HFCs, CFCs, SF₆), 2.1%.
Integrated over the historical record, and accounting for shifts in key economic sectors and their contributing emissions, we see that CO\textsubscript{2} is still the largest contributor to overall temperature increase, but when accounting for the indirect, knock-on effects of the emission of some gases – like CH\textsubscript{4} – which leads to formation of other climate pollutants – like ozone (O\textsubscript{3}) – the combined contribution of other GHGs is about equal to that of CO\textsubscript{2}.

This is especially true for some non-GHG pollution like SO\textsubscript{2} and organic carbon that form aerosols (purple) which cool the planet. As air pollution is reduced, we stop masking the warming of GHGs.
A city’s emissions include different scopes.

“Scope” refers to where emissions physically occur:

- **Scope 1** - emissions within administrative boundaries
- **Scope 2** - emissions associated with imported electricity
- **Scope 3** - transboundary life-cycle supply-chain emissions

These designations lead to so-called “production”-based accounting (scope 1 emissions) or “consumption”-based accounting that includes the community-wide life-cycle (global) footprint of residents and businesses of a city (scope 1+2+3).

Examples of emissions categorized by scope:
**Carbon Dioxide**

**CO\textsubscript{2}**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lifetime</th>
<th>GWP\textsubscript{100}</th>
<th>GWP\textsubscript{20}</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>~120 years</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

GWP for CO\textsubscript{2} is 1 for both 20 and 100 years, by definition, since GWP is defined relative to CO\textsubscript{2}.

**Key facts**
- CO\textsubscript{2} results from combustion of carbon-containing fossil (and biogenic) fuels which are oxidized in the atmosphere through chemical processes that break combustion products up into this very stable and ubiquitous molecule.
- Some CO\textsubscript{2} is taken up by plants, but not nearly as much as we produce.

**Key urban sources of CO\textsubscript{2}**
*(Figures in parentheses are CO\textsubscript{2} emissions from Paris in Mt CO\textsubscript{2}/yr)*
- **Scope 1:**
  - Residential buildings (2.1)
  - Commercial buildings (2.0)
  - Transportation (1.3)
  - Solid waste (0.4)
  - Industry (0.1)

**Scope 2:** Upstream energy (1.3)

**Scope 3:**
- Air transport (8.7)
- Food consumption (4.8)
- Road transport (supply-chain) (3.4)
- Materials/construction (1.5)

**Key urban solutions** – Paris Climate Action Plan, 2018
The lifetime of CO\textsubscript{2} is hundreds of years, so eliminating the use of carbon fuels now will only correct the imbalance sometime later this century, so it is critical to decarbonize quickly, avoid long-term infrastructure CO\textsubscript{2} lock-in and reduce SLCPs:
- Renewable Energy
- Circular economy/energy & waste recovery
- Shared, active and clean transportation*
- Low-emission zones/Smart transit
- Thermal improvement to buildings
- Financing energy renovation and energy management
- Flexible/reversible construction
- Local/low-carbon food production

*Mixed use, compact growth can also reduce distances traveled and enable low-carbon transport.
# Methane

**CH$_4$**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lifetime</th>
<th>GWP$_{100}$</th>
<th>GWP$_{20}$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10-12 years</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

28x more warming than CO$_2$ over 100 years
81x more warming than CO$_2$ over 20 years

## Key facts
- CH$_4$ results from oil/gas extraction and distribution leakage as well as from bacterial decay of organic material in absence of oxygen (i.e., in a landfill or under water).
- Methane is considered both a GHG and an SLCP.
- When methane does break down, it contributes to the formation of ground-level ozone, another SLCP that is also a threat to health.
- Some of the biggest sources of methane globally take place outside of cities but remain attributable to cities (i.e., scope 3 emissions).

## Key urban sources of CH$_4$
- Scope 1: Municipal solid waste decay
- Scope 1: Wastewater decay
- Scope 2: fossil fuel extraction
- Scope 2: fossil fuel distribution
- Scope 3: Livestock Agriculture

## Key urban solutions
- Expand integrated solid waste management
- Circular economy/energy & waste recovery
- Expand/improve wastewater treatment or fecal sludge management
- Source local food
- Reduce fossil-fuel use
- Reduce meat consumption
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key facts</th>
<th>Key urban sources of $\text{N}_2\text{O}$</th>
<th>Key urban solutions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• $\text{N}_2\text{O}$ is produced as a by-product during the remineralization of organic matter via the primary processes of nitrification and denitrification.</td>
<td>• Scope 1: Wastewater processing</td>
<td>• Certify food stocks as fertilizer friendly/organic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• $\text{N}_2\text{O}$ is also released in combustion of fuels.</td>
<td>• Scope 1: Industrial chemical processing (nitric and adipic acid production)</td>
<td>• Practice regenerative/sustainable agriculture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Nitrous oxide emissions have been increasing due to increased use of synthetic fertilizer and manure (adding nitrogen to the soils). Land-based agriculture and fossil fuel burning have been the largest driver of the observed increase through 2019.</td>
<td>• Scope 1: Combustion of fossil fuels</td>
<td>• Expand/improve tertiary wastewater treatment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Since $\text{N}<em>2\text{O}$ has a very similar lifetime to $\text{CO}<em>2$, the GWP$</em>{100}$ is very close to the GWP$</em>{20}$, 273x more warming over both 100 and 20 years.</td>
<td>• Scope 1: Residential solid biofuels</td>
<td>• Regulate chemical industry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Scope 1: Synthetic fertilizers/manure</td>
<td>• Reduce fossil-fuel and biofuel use</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Scope 3: aquaculture</td>
<td>• Enhance modern energy access</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Scope 3: manure management</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Nitrous Oxide**

$\text{N}_2\text{O}$

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lifetime</th>
<th>GWP$_{100}$</th>
<th>GWP$_{20}$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>109 years</td>
<td>273</td>
<td>273</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

273x more warming than $\text{CO}_2$ over 100 years

273x more warming than $\text{CO}_2$ over 20 years
## Hydrofluorocarbons

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lifetime</th>
<th>$\text{GWP}_{100}$</th>
<th>$\text{GWP}_{20}$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10s–100s of years</td>
<td>1000s</td>
<td>1000s</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1000s of times more warming than CO$_2$ over varied lifetimes

### Key facts
- HFCs were introduced as replacements for ozone-depleting CFCs.
- While they break down more readily than CFCs, it is not before they warm the planet significantly with very high GWPs.
- Emissions of HFCs are growing at a rate of 10–15% per year. The global stock of air conditioners in buildings are projected to grow to 5.6 billion by 2050, or 10 new units sold every second for the next 30 years.

### Key urban sources of HFCs (All scope 1)
- A/C, refrigeration
- Foam agents
- Aerosols
- Fire retardants

### Key urban solutions
- Adopt/enforce Kigali Amendment to the Montreal Protocol
- Substitute low- or zero-GWP alternatives, combined with improvements in lifecycle energy efficiency
- Improved insulation/building designs to reduce A/C
### Perfluorocarbons

**PFCs**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lifetime</th>
<th>GWPs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>100s-1000s of years</td>
<td>1,000s-10,000s</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1000x-10,000x more warming than CO2 over varied lifetimes

**Key facts**

- PFC gases do not exist naturally in the atmosphere but are produced synthetically.
- PFCs - like HFCs - replace chlorofluorocarbons (CFCs) but are used in the manufacture of semiconductors and have several other uses.
- Not technically a perfluorocarbon, nitrogen trifluoride, or NF$_3$, is a greenhouse gas, with a global warming potential (GWP$_{100}$) of 18,500 times greater than that of CO$_2$. Its GWP places it second only to SF$_6$ in the Kyoto gases.

**Key urban sources of PFCs**

- Scope 1: By-product during aluminum production
- Scope 1: Solvent in electronics industry
- Scope 1: Specialized refrigeration
- Scope 1: (NF$_3$) Manufacture of flat panel displays, photovoltaics, LEDs and other electronics
- Scope 3: imported products using PFCs in their manufacture

**Key urban solutions**

- Strict inventory reporting for PFCs and NF$_3$
- Materials efficiency, circular material flows and emerging primary processes
- Fluorine gas (F$_2$, diatomic fluorine) is a climate neutral - but highly toxic - replacement for nitrogen trifluoride in some manufacturing applications; however, it requires more stringent handling and safety precautions, especially to protect manufacturing personnel.
# Sulfur Hexafluoride

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key facts</th>
<th>Key urban solutions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• SF$_6$ is an inorganic compound that is a colorless, odorless, non-flammable, and non-toxic gas.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Its observed increase over the last 40 years was driven in large part by the expanding electric power sector, including fugitive emissions from banks of SF$_6$ gas contained in medium- and high-voltage switchgear.</td>
<td>• Strict inventory reporting for SF$_6$ to ID local sources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Electrical switches</td>
<td>• Regulate semiconductor etchants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Etchant in semiconductor industry</td>
<td>• Alternative melt-protection for magnesium manufacture (e.g., fluorinated ketone with N$_2$/CO$_2$)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Casting for magnesium (mostly in China, Canada, Russia and USA)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sulfur Hexafluoride (SF$_6$)</th>
<th>Lifetime</th>
<th>GWP$_{100}$</th>
<th>GWP$_{20}$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3,200 years</td>
<td>25,200</td>
<td>18,300</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

25,200x more warming than CO$_2$ over 100 years
18,300x more warming than CO$_2$ over 20 years
## Emission Inventory Comparison

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Population</td>
<td>3.9 Million</td>
<td>9 Million</td>
<td>2.5 Million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Per Capita GDP</td>
<td>$182,000</td>
<td>$21,000</td>
<td>$7,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO₂e (all GHGs at BASIC+*)</td>
<td>37.5 Mt</td>
<td>46.6 Mt</td>
<td>3.4 Mt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% from CO₂</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>89%</td>
<td>78%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% from CH₄</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% from N₂O</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% from HFCs</td>
<td>4.7%</td>
<td>0.2%</td>
<td>NE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% from PFCs (mostly NF₃)</td>
<td>0.2%</td>
<td>NE</td>
<td>NE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% from SF₆</td>
<td>0.0001%</td>
<td>NE</td>
<td>NE</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Basic+ is an inventory reporting level that covers all scope 1 and scope 2 sources except from imported waste as well as scope 3 emissions from the stationary energy and transportation sectors.

All sources contain a mix of GHGs, SLCPs and other climate-impactful air pollutants.

Effect of a one year pulse of present-day emissions on global surface temperature

Red box identifies sectors most relevant for urban Scope 1 and 2 emissions

Source: IPCC WGI, 2021, Fig 6.16 (see references)
Urbanization and income affect urban GHG emissions.

Urbanization has historically increased GHG emissions.

- The urbanization and adjustment of industrial structure has historically driven energy consumption and carbon emissions.

The transition from lower-income to higher-income urban structure affects the mix of pollutants.

- The shift from agricultural economies (with more methane from waste and wastewater and N\textsubscript{2}O emissions from agriculture) to industrial economy (more CO\textsubscript{2}, HFC/PFC/SF\textsubscript{6} emissions from industries and buildings) will shift the main contributing gases.

The scope of emission sources will also change as cities become denser, industrialize and outsource energy and food supply.

- Increasing wealth enables enhanced treatment of waste/wastewater, reducing Scope 1 methane emissions.
- The magnitude of upstream emissions will vary as a function of upstream energy sources, transportation patterns and agricultural/food supply chains (Stronger consumer demand for energy and meat may increase Scope 3).

As cities develop an increase in carbon footprint is not inevitable.

- Local regulation can reduce Scope 1 emissions.
- Local and national regulation can impact Scope 3.
## Urban mitigation summary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Key pollutants</th>
<th>Mitigation options</th>
<th>Potential impacts of urban planning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Transportation</td>
<td>CO(_2), Diesel particulate, HFCs (auto air conditioning)</td>
<td>Electrify light duty, DPFs/clean fuels for heavy duty, low-carbon public transit options and Transit-oriented development</td>
<td>Planning for mixed-use and compact development that is coordinated with public and non-motorized transportation options, as well as the provision of public electric vehicle charging infrastructure, can reduce transportation emissions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Power</td>
<td>CO(_2), CH(_4) (upstream fossil fuel production), SF(_6) (electrical switches)</td>
<td>EE/RE w grid optimization, solar microgrids</td>
<td>Building regulations can enable the adoption of distributed renewable energy.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industrial Point Sources</td>
<td>CO(_2), PFCs (Aluminum and electronics manufacture), SF(_6) (magnesium casting), HFCs (fire retardants, aerosols, foams), N(_2)O (nitric and adipic acid production)</td>
<td>EE &amp; materials efficiency, circular material flows and adopt emerging primary processes for PFCs, Alternative materials for switches and alternative processes for electronics/ magnesium manufacture for SF6, Careful use of F(_2).</td>
<td>Compact and coordinated development, as well as updated regulations, can reduce the quantity of construction materials required for buildings and infrastructure (primarily cement and steel), which reduces embodied emissions associated with manufacturing these materials.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waste/Wastewater</td>
<td>CH(_4)</td>
<td>ISWM, expand/tertiary WW treatment</td>
<td>Cities can reduce methane from waste by increasing waste collection, minimizing open dumping and uncontrolled landfilling, managing landfill gas, and diverting organic waste from landfills.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buildings</td>
<td>CO(_2) (combustion of fossil-fuels), BC/OC (combustion of residential solid biofuels), HFCs (A/C)</td>
<td>RE/EE w/modern energy services for residential cooking &amp; heating, materials efficiency for construction, low-GWP alternatives for A/C</td>
<td>Density, building height and building design impact the energy efficiency of buildings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food systems</td>
<td>CH(_4) (livestock), N(_2)O (fertilizer application), HFCs (refrigeration), BC/OC (Open burning of crop residue)</td>
<td>Local/sustainable agriculture; shift food preferences</td>
<td>Planning that enables farmer's markets and urban farming can support local agriculture and reduce emissions associated with food packaging and transport.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To explore the GHG benefit of various options, see tools for modeling future scenarios at the city level [here](#).  
Source: Authors
Key takeaways

- CO$_2$ constitutes the majority of city emissions.

- The mix of non-CO$_2$ GHGs can vary. Contributions from methane and nitrous oxide depend on the degree of upstream fossil fuel production/extraction, agricultural practices, and the volume of waste produced and how it is disposed.

- HFCs, PFCs and SF$_6$ are smaller contributors, often not estimated at the municipal level, and may require global action and regulation.

- Key city actions include reducing fossil fuel use through renewable energy, energy efficiency, integrated solid waste management, enhanced wastewater treatment, electrification of transportation, compact and coordinated urban growth, and local food production/food choice.

- Key sources emit a mix of pollutants. This means that reducing emissions can yield not only climate benefits, but also public health, agriculture, energy and economic benefits, as eliminating key sources can eliminate a wide range of pollutants simultaneously.
Acknowledgments

This presentation was prepared by Gary Kleiman for the City Climate Finance Gap Fund, with guidance and inputs from Chandan Deuskar and Augustin Maria. The Gap Fund thanks Megha Mukim and Mark Roberts for valuable feedback.